

Annex A

The Regime of Systematic Domination and Oppression of Women and Girls Institutionalized by the Taliban in Afghanistan, an Emblematic Example

On 8 March 2023, prominent Afghan and Iranian human rights defenders were joined by international jurists and human rights defenders in a campaign to End Gender Apartheid, calling for the severe forms of segregation and discrimination based on gender in these countries to be recognized as a form of apartheid. The situation for women and girls in Afghanistan continues to deteriorate—new decrees and restrictions announced in July and August 2023 continue to shrink access to education and public life for Afghan women by barring female students from travelling on academic scholarships, banning women from visiting the UNESCO World Heritage Site Bande-Amir national park, and ordering the shuttering of women's beauty salons.²

The concept of gender apartheid has long been recognized by international officials, lawyers, scholars, and human rights defenders with reference to Afghanistan.³ Indeed the Taliban's abuses, during both periods of their rule, have epitomized gender apartheid and illustrated the need for this concept within international law. In 1999, during the Taliban's first period of rule, the UN Special Rapporteur on civil and political rights submitted a report to the UN Commission on Human Rights, in which he stated that "the Taliban has introduced what is in point of fact *a system of apartheid* in respect of women." UN bodies and officials, former Afghan leaders, and human rights defenders and organizations have frequently echoed this language, referring to the Taliban's policies as gender apartheid. The following are some examples of the use of this term in the period since the Taliban again imposed systematized oppression and domination of women and girls after they seized power for a second time in 2021:⁸

- In January 2023, UN Secretary General António Guterres said, "[i]n Afghanistan, unprecedented, systemic attacks on women's and girls' rights and the flouting of international obligations are creating gender-based apartheid." 9
- In May 2023, the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, Volker Türk, stated that the Taliban's efforts "to seek to erase half of the population from everyday life" amounts to "a system of gender apartheid." ¹⁰
- In June 2023, the UN Special Rapporteur on the human rights situation in Afghanistan, Richard Bennett, and the UN Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, in a joint report to the Human Rights Council set out a definition of gender apartheid and wrote that that definition "is an accurate description of the situation documented in the present report, in which systematic discrimination against women and girls is at the heart of Taliban ideology and rule." They called on States to "[m]andate a report on gender apartheid as an institutionalised system of discrimination, segregation, humiliation and exclusion of women and girls, with a view to developing further normative standards and tools, galvanizing international legal condemnation and action to end it and ensure its non-repetition." 11

- On 14 August 2023, ahead of the two-year anniversary of Kabul's fall to the Taliban, a group of 32 UN experts condemned the Taliban's policies as a "system of discrimination with the intention to subject women and girls to total domination so egregious"...that it has "necessitated a discussion about the codification of 'gender apartheid." 12
- On 15 August 2023, a joint statement signed by numerous human rights organizations including Amnesty International and Human Rights Watch cited the use of the term "gender apartheid" by the Special Rapporteur and the Working Group and called for stronger international accountability amidst the increasing normalization of the Taliban's abuses.¹³
- Also on 15 August 2023, UN Women Executive Director Sima Bahous released a statement condemning "the [Taliban's] comprehensive, systematic, and unparalleled assault on the rights of women and girls ... that is rightly and widely considered gender apartheid."¹⁴
- In September 2023, Special Rapporteur Bennett reaffirmed his warnings before the Human Rights Council, repeating that the crisis "necessitate[s] an examination of the evolving phenomenon of gender apartheid."¹⁵
- On September 26, 2023, UN Women Executive Director Bahous urged the members of the UN Security Council to "lend [their] full support to an intergovernmental process to explicitly codify gender apartheid in international law" explaining that "[t]he tools the international community has at its disposal were not created to respond to mass, statesponsored gender oppression. This systematic and planned assault on women's rights is foundational to the Taliban's vision of state and society and it must be named, defined and proscribed in our global norms so that we can respond appropriately." 16

The Taliban has imposed restrictions severely curtailing the autonomy and agency of women and girls in virtually every aspect of their lives. As UN Women wrote in a 2022 report, "[w]omen are systematically excluded from public and political life, and restricted in their access to education, humanitarian assistance, employment, justice and health services." The Taliban has imposed such restrictions on women and girls through a series of "edicts," as well as a series of announcements, which come in the form of "guidance" or "recommendations" and are made by or on behalf of senior government officials. In practice, both the "edicts" and the "announcements" are mandatory and enforced by the Taliban. Between September 2021 and May 2023, more than 50 edicts were issued, 19 restricting every aspect of the lives of women and girls.

The Taliban's restrictions are most evident in the prohibition on women in government, the restrictions and outright bans on education, restrictions on the right to movement, limits on employment, limits on access to healthcare, the unequal status of women in family and cultural life, and impunity for gender-based violence.

• Representation in Government: The curtailment of women's rights began with an announcement on 31 August 2021, shortly after the Taliban took over, that no women would occupy top leadership positions in a Taliban government.²⁰ This was followed by the establishment of an all-male caretaker Cabinet on 7 September 2021. Leaving no room for gender inclusivity, the Taliban has thus "failed to include women in any decision-making forum at both national and sub-national levels." Shortly thereafter, the *de facto* authorities physically took over and converted the premises of the former Ministry of Women's affairs to that of the now *de facto* Ministry for the Propagation of Virtue and

Prevention of Vice.²² These actions have contributed to the virtual erasure of women from public life.

- Education: Women and girls are also completely excluded from secondary and tertiary education, and also restricted from primary education.²³ On 18 September 2021, the *de facto* Ministry of Education announced that only boys could attend secondary school and only male teachers could teach in boys' schools.²⁴ A little more than a year later, in December 2022, the *de facto* Ministry of Higher Education ordered an indefinite ban on university and other forms of higher education for the country's women.²⁵
- Freedom of Movement: The Taliban has also enforced restrictions on the freedom of movement of women and girls in several ways. The Taliban has banned the access of women and girls to hammams (public baths), parks, gyms, and Band-e-Amir national park, prohibited them from leaving their home without a male relative (mahram), and obligated them to abide by a strict hijab requirement. On 7 May 2022, the Ministry for the Propagation of Virtue and Prevention of Vice issued a directive on the hijab which also "recommended that 'the best form of observance of the Sharia hijab' was for women to avoid leaving the house altogether, unless absolutely necessary. These policies have created an environment in which it is difficult for women and girls to leave their homes, including to access services or aid.
- **Employment**: The participation of women in the workforce has also been restricted "through the imposition of bans on women registering organizations, working in non-governmental and foreign organizations (such as in embassies and with the United Nations), instructing women civil servants in most sectors not to report to work, restricting physical access to employment sites without a *mahram*, and preventing women from pursuing professional training." As a result of these practices, "[w]omen's employment dropped 25 percent between the second quarter of 2021 and the fourth quarter of 2022, compared to a 7 per cent decline for men." 29
- **Healthcare:** The healthcare system in Afghanistan established during the Republic era relied on subcontracts to NGOs and private health facilities. Once the Taliban took control, the disruptions to foreign assistance had a devastating impact on the delivery of critical services. Women's access to healthcare is further limited by the restrictions on movement and dress, and the Taliban-imposed restrictions on healthcare professionals seeing patients of the opposite sex, restrictions on women undermining their ability to work in the health sector, and a requirement in some areas that women be escorted to any health appointments by a *mahram*, a policy that violates women's privacy and jeopardizes their access to care.³⁰ A report by Human Rights Watch further explains the challenges faced by women and girls, including access to contraception.³¹
- Family and Cultural Life: As the Special Rapporteur on the human rights situation in Afghanistan has noted, the Taliban takeover has dramatically increased the levels of discrimination many women and girls face within their families.³² This discrimination encourages harmful practices including "forced and/or child marriage, polygamy, dowry obligations, discriminatory requirements for guardianship and custody of children, legal and practical inequalities in divorce and division of matrimonial assets, lack of access to

the right to remarry following dissolution of marriage or death of the husband, and the unequal status of widows and of women and girls in relation to inheritance."³³ Authorities, including judges and provincial governors, have been emboldened by the Taliban to be complicit in these abuses by, for example, upholding child and forced marriages and supporting impunity for these and other forms of gender-based violence.³⁴ This discrimination leaves women and girls trapped in homes that are often increasingly dangerous for them.

The Taliban authorities have also limited women's and girls' participation in cultural life and in sports.³⁵ In September 2021, the deputy head of the Taliban cultural commission stated that "women would not be allowed to participate in sport since their participation was considered neither appropriate nor necessary."³⁶ Ever since, women have been deprived of their right to participate in cultural life and sports and many women athletes have been forced into exile.³⁷

Gender-based Violence: The Taliban regime has reinforced and maintained a system of oppression by intentionally ensuring a system of impunity. Once in power, the Taliban authorities "reduced protective, preventative and support services for women and girls, and the accessibility of safe spaces or shelters for them to escape violence."³⁸ Women and girls experiencing gender-based violence no longer have any meaningful recourse to state assistance. As noted by women in Afghanistan, "the current restrictive environment outside the home and economic pressures are resulting in significant tensions within the home, leading to domestic violence." Moreover, as experts have warned, "the systemic discrimination against women and girls is normalizing gender-based violence against them, both inside and outside the home."40 There are also numerous reports of "gender-related killings, or femicide, stemming from the systematic enforcement of discriminatory gender roles and punishments for what the de facto authorities deem as inappropriate female behaviour."41 The State has a responsibility to investigate and punish gender-based violence by private actors, and to work to prevent such violence. Under the Taliban, there has been near complete impunity for these acts. As the United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan reported, "[n]one of the cases [of violence against women and girls] have been processed through the formal justice system" and that "[s]pecialised police and prosecution units, and courts, established by previous governments as part of the implementation of the 2009 Elimination of Violence Against Women Law were removed from the *de facto* authority's budget for 2022."⁴²

Speaking of the lived experiences of women in Afghanistan, Shaharzad Akbar, the Executive Director of Afghan NGO Rawadari and former head of the Afghanistan Independent Human Rights Commission, described how women talk about "being buried alive, breathing but not being able to do much else without facing restrictions and punishments, their lives held still while the lives of the men around them, their male children, their brothers, their husbands, move forward." Collectively, the discrimination against women and girls in Afghanistan amounts to more than just grave breaches of their basic human rights. This pervasive, systematic control and domination of women and girls should be identified by what it is: a system of gender apartheid.

¹ The effort is being led by Iranian and Afghan women, international lawyers, and women leaders across the world. Information *available at* https://endgenderapartheid.today.

- ³ See, e.g., K. Bennoune, "The International Obligation to Counter Gender Apartheid in Afghanistan," 54(1) Columbia Human Rights Law Review (2022), available at https://hrlr.law.columbia.edu/hrlr/the-international-obligation-to-counter-gender-apartheid-in-afghanistan/ pp. 18-23; A. E. Mayer, "A Benign Apartheid: How Gender Apartheid Has Been Rationalized," 5(2) UCLA Journal of International Law and Foreign Affairs 237 (2000).
- ⁴ UN Economic and Social Council, Commission on Human Rights, *Report submitted by Mr. Abdelfattah Amor, Special Rapporteur, in accordance with Commission on Human Rights resolution*, E/CN.4/1999/58 (11 Jan. 1999), para. 26 (emphasis added).
- ⁵ See, e.g., *ibid.*; United Nations, "Afghanistan: Taliban 'may be responsible for gender apartheid' says rights expert," *UN News* (19 June 2023), *available at* https://news.un.org/en/story/2023/06/1137847.
- ⁶ See, e.g., E. M. Lederer, "Former Afghan MP: Taliban is a 'gender apartheid' regime," Associated Press (12 Sept. 2022), available at https://apnews.com/article/afghanistan-race-and-ethnicity-racial-injustice-united-nations-taliban-e545022f191d5b5f00af82231915a7e5; A. E. Mayer, "A Benign Apartheid: How Gender Apartheid Has Been Rationalized," 5(2) UCLA Journal of International Law and Foreign Affairs 237 (2000), p. 279 (noting that Burhanuddin Rabbani, the former President of Afghanistan who was ousted by the Taliban in 1996, described the Taliban's system of gender discrimination as gender apartheid).
- ⁷ See N. Gallagher, "The International Campaign against Gender Apartheid in Afghanistan," 5(2) UCLA Journal of International Law and Foreign Affairs (2000), pp. 387-389 (describing two significant campaigns in the late 1990s that campaigned for the end of gender apartheid in Afghanistan: (1) the Feminist Majority Foundation's "Campaign to Stop Gender Apartheid in Afghanistan," and (2) "A Flower for the Women of Kabul" campaign organized by the European Union's Humanitarian Agency and Doctors Without Borders). See also K. Roth (Twitter) (20 June 2023), available at https://twitter.com/KenRoth/status/1671030173624401921 (@KenRoth: "The UN's top expert on rights in Afghanistan urged countries...to consider making 'gender apartheid' an international crime, helping hold the Taliban accountable for its grave and systematic abuses against Afghan women.' He is right.").
- ⁸ See UN Human Rights Council, Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, A/HRC/53/21 (15 June 2023) (explaining that both gender persecution and gender apartheid are occurring). See also M. Mehran & Afghanistan Research Network/PeaceRep, Recognition of Gender Apartheid in Afghanistan Justified (June 2023), available at: https://peacerep.org/wp-content/uploads/2023/06/PeaceRep-Afghanistan-Research-Network-Reflection_06.pdf; N. Farid & R. de Silva de Alwis, "Afghanistan under the Taliban: A State of 'Gender Apartheid?," Princeton SPIA Afghanistan Policy Lab (Jan. 2023), available at https://spia.princeton.edu/sites/default/files/2023-02/SPIA_NaheedRangita_PolicyBrief_07.pdf; K. Bennoune, "The International Obligation to Counter Gender Apartheid in Afghanistan," 54(1) Columbia Human Rights Law Review (2022), available at https://hrlr.law.columbia.edu/hrlr/the-international-obligation-to-counter-gender-apartheid-in-afghanistan/, Part II(C).
- ⁹ United Nations, "The Secretary-General's remarks to the Security Council on the Promotion and Strengthening of the Rule of Law in the Maintenance of International Peace and Security: The Rule of Law Among Nations," (12 Jan. 2023), available at https://www.un.org/sg/en/content/sg/statement/2023-01-12/the-secretary-generals-remarks-the-security-council-the-promotion-and-strengthening-of-the-rule-of-law-the-maintenance-of-international-peace-and-security-the-rule-of.
- ¹⁰ UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, "Türk: 'There should be a UN Human Rights Office everywhere" (24 May 2023), *available at* https://www.ohchr.org/en/statements/2023/05/turk-there-should-be-un-human-rights-office-everywhere.

-

² M. Yunus Yawar & C. Greenfield, "Beauty salon ban in Afghanistan a blow to women's financial freedom," *Reuters* (24 July 2023), *available at* https://www.reuters.com/world/asia-pacific/beauty-salon-ban-afghanistan-blow-womens-financial-freedom-2023-07-21/; "Rights groups condemn Taliban's new curbs on women's education, movement," *Al Jazeera* (28 Aug. 2023), *available at* https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2023/8/28/rights-groups-condemn-talibans-new-curbs-on-womens-education-movement.

¹¹ UN Human Rights Council, Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan - Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, A/HRC/53/21 (15 June 2023), paras. 95, 100(c).

- ¹² UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights, "Afghanistan: UN human rights experts denounce idea of 'reformed' Taliban" (14 Aug. 2023), *available at* https://www.ohchr.org/en/statements/2023/08/afghanistan-unhuman-rights-experts-denounce-idea-reformed-taliban.
- ¹³ Alliance for Human Rights in Afghanistan, "Joint Statement Afghanistan: call for Justice accountability and effective response to ongoing violations and gender persecution" (15 Aug. 2023), *available at* https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/media 2023/08/Alliance%20-
- %20Joint%20statement%20marking%20two%20years%20since%20Taliban%20takeover%20-%2015%20August-%20Final%202 0.pdf.
- ¹⁴ UN Women, Statement on Afghanistan by UN Women Executive Director Sima Bahous (15 Aug. 2023), available at https://www.unwomen.org/en/news-stories/statement/2023/08/statement-on-afghanistan-by-un-women-executive-director-sima-bahous.
- ¹⁵ UN Human Rights Council, Special Rapporteur to Human Rights Council: the Systematic and Institutionalised Discrimination that Seeks to Exclude Women from All Facets of Life in Afghanistan Necessitates an Examination of the Evolving Phenomenon of Gender Apartheid (11 Sept. 2023), available at https://www.ohchr.org/en/news/2023/09/special-rapporteur-human-rights-council-systematic-and-institutionalised.
- ¹⁶ UN Security Council, Statement delivered by Ms Sima Bahous, UN Under-Secretary-General and UN Women Executive Director, to the UN Security Council meeting on the situation in Afghanistan (26 Sep. 2023), available at https://www.unwomen.org/en/news-stories/speech/2023/09/speech-the-womens-rights-crisis-listen-to-invest-in-include-and-support-afghan-women.
- ¹⁷ UN Women, *Women's rights in Afghanistan one year after the Taliban take-over* (15 Aug. 2022), *available at* https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/2022-08/Gender-alert-2-Womens-rights-in-Afghanistan-one-year-after-the-Taliban-take-over-en 0.pdf.
- ¹⁸ See United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan, Human Rights in Afghanistan: 15 August 2021-15 June 2022 (July 2022), available at https://unama.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/unama_human_rights_in_afghanistan_report_-june 2022_english.pdf.
- ¹⁹ UN Human Rights Council, *Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls*, A/HRC/53/21 (Advance edited version) (20 June 2023), *available at* https://www.ohchr.org/en/documents/country-reports/ahrc5321-situation-women-and-girls-afghanistan-report-special-rapporteur, para. 17 (explaining that both gender persecution and gender apartheid are occurring).
- ²⁰ *Id.*, par. 24.
- ²¹ See United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan, *Human Rights in Afghanistan: 15 August 2021-15 June 2022* (July 2022), *available at* https://unama.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/unama human rights in afghanistan report -

june 2022 english.pdf, p. 31.

- ²² Ibid.
- ²³ Ibid.
- ²⁴ UN Human Rights Council, *Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls*, A/HRC/53/21 (15 June 2023), para. 36. *See also* E. Graham-Harrison, "Taliban ban girls from secondary education in Afghanistan," *The Guardian* (17 Sept. 2021), *available at* https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/sep/17/taliban-ban-girls-from-secondary-education-in-afghanistan.
- ²⁵ UN Human Rights Council, Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, A/HRC/53/21 (15 June 2023), para. 37. See also H. Noori & agencies in Kabul, "Taliban ban Afghan women from

university education," *The Guardian* (20 Dec. 2022), *available at* https://www.theguardian.com/world/2022/dec/20/taliban-ban-afghan-women-university-education.

- ²⁶ UN Women, *Gender alert no. 2: Women's rights in Afghanistan one year after the Taliban take-over* (15 Aug. 2022), *available at* https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/2022-08/Gender-alert-2-Womens-rights-in-Afghanistan-one-year-after-the-Taliban-take-over-en 0.pdf, p. 3, note 18.
- ²⁷ See United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan, *Human Rights in Afghanistan: 15 August 2021-15 June 2022* (July 2022), *available at* https://unama.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/unama_human_rights_in_afghanistan_report_-june 2022 english.pdf, p. 33.
- ²⁸ UN Human Rights Council, Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, A/HRC/53/21 (15 June 2023), para. 44.
- ²⁹ *Id.*, para. 45.
- ³⁰ *Id.*, para. 59. *See also* UN Women, *Gender alert no. 2: Women's rights in Afghanistan one year after the Taliban take-over* (15 Aug. 2022), *available at* https://www.unwomen.org/sites/default/files/2022-08/Gender-alert-2-Womens-rights-in-Afghanistan-one-year-after-the-Taliban-take-over-en 0.pdf, p. 5.
- ³¹ Human Rights Watch, "I Would Like Four Kids If We Stay Alive' Women's Access to Health Care in Afghanistan" (2021), *available at* https://reliefweb.int/report/afghanistan/i-would-four-kids-if-we-stay-alive-women-s-access-health-care-afghanistan, pp. 38-41. *See also* Human Rights Watch, "Afghanistan: Taliban Deprive Women of Livelihoods, Identity" (2022), *available at* https://www.hrw.org/news/2022/01/18/afghanistan-taliban-deprive-women-livelihoods-identity.
- ³² UN Human Rights Council, Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, A/HRC/53/21 (15 June 2023), para. 66.
- 33 Ihid.
- ³⁴ See United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan, *Human Rights in Afghanistan: 15 August 2021-15 June 2022*) (July 2022), *available at* https://unama.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/unama_human_rights_in_afghanistan_report_-_june_2022_english.pdf, pp. 31-32.
- ³⁵ UN Human Rights Council, Situation of women and girls in Afghanistan Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in Afghanistan and the Working Group on discrimination against women and girls, A/HRC/53/21 (15 June 2023), para. 70.
- ³⁶ *Ibid*.
- ³⁷ Ibid.
- ³⁸ *Id.*, para. 76.
- ³⁹ Ibid.
- ⁴⁰ Ibid.
- ⁴¹ *Id.*, para. 77.
- ⁴² United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan, *Human Rights in Afghanistan: 15 August 2021-15 June 2022* (July 2022), *available at*
- https://unama.unmissions.org/sites/default/files/unama_human_rights_in_afghanistan_report_june_2022_english.pdf, p. 34.
- ⁴³ United Nations, "Afghanistan: Taliban 'may be responsible for gender apartheid' says rights expert," *UN News* (19 June 2023), *available at* https://news.un.org/en/story/2023/06/1137847.